

**REPORT NO. 50**  
of the  
**WINDSOR-ESSEX COUNTY ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE (WECEC)**  
of its meeting held January 6, 2011  
Conference Room, Windsor Airport

---

**Present:** Councillor Alan Halberstadt  
Tamara Stomp Deputy Mayor Town of Kingsville  
Charlie Wright Deputy Mayor Town of Leamington  
Pauline Cheslock  
Mark Bartlet  
Matthew Child  
Troy Brian  
Dean Clevett  
Derek Coronado  
Rick Coronado  
David Diemer  
Phil Roberts  
John Miller

**Your Committee submits the following recommendation:**

Moved by P. Roberts, seconded by P. Cheslock

That Air Quality Motion **BE ENDORSED** attached as Appendix "C".

**NOTE:** The report of the Air Quality Sub-Committee is attached.

---

COMMITTEE COORDINATOR

---

CHAIRPERSON

**Notification:**

Name	Email Address
WECEC	ON FILE
County Council	ON FILE

## Air Quality Motion

**Whereas** the City of Windsor and County of Essex receive significant amounts of air pollution generated by coal-fired power plants ( $\geq 50\%$  during the summer) throughout the United States (*Transboundary Air Quality in Ontario*, Ontario Ministry of the Environment, 2005),

**Whereas** Ontario's coal-fired power plants are one of our largest sources of greenhouse gasses, a major cause of acid rain, a major contributor to smog and a major source of toxins such as mercury and lead (DSS Management Consultants Inc. & RWDI Air Inc., *Cost Benefit Analysis: Replacing Ontario's Coal-Fired Electricity Generation*, Prepared for Ontario Ministry of Energy, April, 2005),

**Whereas** Ontario's coal-free electricity generation capacity is now greater than Ontario's peak demand for electricity in the summer of 2010 and 28% greater than the forecast peak demand in 2014 (Independent Electricity System Operator, *Ontario Reserve Margin Requirements 2010-2014*, October 1, 2009),

**Whereas** Ontario imports coal-fired power from the United States whenever the "financial" cost (excluding public health and environmental costs) is less than the "financial" cost of the next unit of domestic electricity generation (IESO Policy communicated to Ontario Clean Air Alliance) - undermining the purpose of a coal phase-out,

**The following is recommended:**

- i) That the City of Windsor request the Government of Ontario to direct Ontario Power Generation to put its coal plants on standby reserve immediately and operate them only if there is a power emergency;
- ii) That the City of Windsor request that the Government of Ontario stop the import of coal-fired power from the United States and import coal-fired power only if there is no other option to keep the lights on in Ontario.

There is another environmental impact from the Detroit Edison(DTE) Monroe power plant. The DTE Monroe power plant uses up to 2 billion gallons of water a day. The source of the water is the whole flow of the River Raisin and the rest of the water comes from Lake Erie's shallow western basin waters - average depth 24'. The DTE Monroe company 2005-6 water use/fish kill studies show 25.4 million fish a year impinged(caught against the screens) and 141 million fish a year entrained(eggs, larvae and juvenile fish that go through the screens). Gizzard shad(a walleye forage fish) had the highest number of fish impinged. Small mouth bass had the largest number of fish eggs entrained. Gizzard shad had the largest number of larval and juvenile fish entrained. The contribution to the algae growth plaguing western Lake Erie from the DTE Monroe plants heated waters is unknown. Walleye numbers in Lake Erie are on the decline - over 80 million five years ago and less than 20 million in 2010. 80% of Lake Erie's water is used by power plant intakes (USGS) also known as once through cooling.

**MDNRE News Release**

**FOR IMMEDIATE  
RELEASE**

**Dec. 22, 2010**

**Contact: Mary Dettloff 517-335-3014**

### **DNRE Approves Air Permit for Detroit Edison's Coal-Fired Power Plant in Monroe**

The Department of Natural Resources and Environment today announced it has approved the air permit for the Detroit Edison's Monroe Power Plant pollution control project and fuel optimization plan. The modification includes addition of new wet flue gas desulfurization and selective catalytic reduction systems to reduce emissions from four existing pulverized coal-fired boilers.

The emission reductions from the control project are expected to be approximately 49.2 million pounds per year of nitrogen oxides, 7.5 million pounds per year of particulate,

215.9 million pounds per year of sulfur dioxide, and 1,400 pounds per year of lead. This project will bring over \$1 billion in construction to Monroe County.

The DTE Monroe Power Plant is the fourth largest coal-fired utility plant in the United States. The air quality permit gives the greenlight to the second phase of one of the largest pollution prevention projects in North America.

In addition to the control equipment, the modifications to the boilers include increasing the use of subbituminous coal and adding the combustion of petroleum coke; upgrading the coal handling systems; installing petroleum coke handling systems, installing limestone and gypsum handling systems, and installing diesel fuel-fired quench pumps.

The decision follows a period of extensive review by the DNRE of Detroit Edison's application, supporting information, and public comment. All documents regarding this decision are available at <http://www.deq.state.mi.us/aps/cwerp.shtml> (see Permit to Install No. 93-09A) or contact staff of the Air Quality Division at 517-373-2098.

The Department of Natural Resources and Environment is committed to the conservation, protection, management, and accessible use and enjoyment of the state's environment, natural resources and related economic interests for current and future generations. For more information, go to [www.michigan.gov/dnre](http://www.michigan.gov/dnre).

#####

**\* News from Beyond Nuclear \***  
**\* Citizens Environment Alliance of Southwestern Ontario \***  
**\* Don't Waste Michigan \* Green Party of Ohio \***

**For Immediate Release: December 30, 2010**

Contact: Kevin Kamps, Beyond Nuclear, (240) 462-3216; Michael Keegan, Don't Waste Michigan, (734) 770-1441; Joe DeMare, Green Party of Ohio, (419) 973-5841.

**Environmental Coalition Challenges "Radioactive Russian Roulette"  
of 20 Year License Extension at Davis-Besse  
*Wind and Solar Can Replace Nuclear Power,  
Accident Costs Low-balled, Groups Allege***

Oak Harbor, Ohio—This week, an environmental coalition has officially intervened against the 20 year license extension sought by First Energy Nuclear Operating Company (FENOC) for its Davis-Besse atomic reactor. The groups – Beyond Nuclear, Citizens Environment Alliance of Southwestern Ontario, Don't Waste Michigan, and the Green Party of Ohio – allege that wind and solar photovoltaic (PV) power, and certainly a combination of the two renewable energies, can readily replace Davis-Besse's electricity by the end of its 40 year operating license in 2017. The intervention petition and request for a hearing to the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's (NRC) Atomic Safety and Licensing Board (posted at Beyond Nuclear's homepage, [www.beyondnuclear.org](http://www.beyondnuclear.org)) also asserts that the potential casualties and costs that could be caused by a severe radioactivity release from Davis-Besse have been grossly underestimated.

Kevin Kamps of Beyond Nuclear, a party to the intervention, said "Granting Davis-Besse 20 additional years to operate would be playing radioactive Russian roulette on the Great Lakes shoreline."

Beyond Nuclear has prepared a background summary on Davis-Besse's trouble-plagued history, including some of the closest-calls to major accidents in U.S. history. Among these were a Three Mile Island reactor meltdown precursor accident in 1977, a 1985 loss of cooling to the reactor core, a 1998 tornado strike, and the infamous 2002 hole-in-the-head reactor lid corrosion accident (a 2010 lid leak shows the problem is recurring). Each of these four incidents came unacceptably close to causing a reactor core loss-of-coolant-accident, which could have led to a full nuclear meltdown. The Davis-Besse backgrounder is posted at the Beyond Nuclear website at [http://www.beyondnuclear.org/storage/Davis\\_Besse\\_Backgrounder.pdf](http://www.beyondnuclear.org/storage/Davis_Besse_Backgrounder.pdf).

The environmental intervenors' expert witness on renewable power sources, such as wind and solar PV readily replacing Davis-Besse, is Alvin D. Compaan, Ph.D., Distinguished University Professor of Physics, Emeritus, at the University of Toledo, and former Chair of UT's Physics and Astronomy Department. UT physics undergrad also Kathryn Hoepfl provided intervenors with analysis showing that a combination of wind and solar could readily replace Davis-Besse.

"The good news is that vast renewable energy sources, such as wind power and solar PV, coupled with  
(continued)

energy efficiency, are ready and cost-effective today. Efficiency and renewables will benefit everyone's pocket book, health, safety, and environment, and do not risk catastrophic radioactivity releases for the sake of corporate greed," said intervenor Joe DeMare of Rossford, Ohio, a Wood County Green Party member. "Opposition to nuclear power is in keeping with the Greens' Key Principle of Ecological Wisdom," he added.

The intervention filing extensively documented the vast offshore wind power potential of Lake Erie, as well as vast on-land wind power potential in Ohio, and the ability of a combination of wind power and solar PV to readily displace Davis-Besse. An NRC ruling this week in a separate proceeding may provide a significant precedent for the Davis-Besse license extension dispute. On December 28, the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board (ASLB) overseeing the Calvert Cliffs Unit 3 new reactor application in Maryland ruled in favor of environmental intervenors, including Beyond Nuclear, ordering NRC staff and the nuclear utility to more realistically consider the vast potential of offshore wind power, as well as a combination of renewable energy technologies, as alternatives to nuclear power. A link to the Calvert Cliffs 3 ASLB ruling has been posted at Beyond Nuclear's website:

<http://www.beyondnuclear.org/nuclear-power/2010/12/29/nrc-licensing-board-bolsters-argument-that-renewables-can-re.html>.

The intervenors' concluding contention holds that FENOC has vastly understated the true costs that would occur in the aftermath of a catastrophic radioactivity release at Davis-Besse.

"Davis-Besse risks a Chernobyl-type nuclear catastrophe in the heart of the Great Lakes," said intervenor Derek Coronado, coordinator of the Citizens Environment Alliance of Southwestern Ontario, based in Windsor. "Its current, ongoing leaks of hazardous tritium into the watershed are bad enough, but a catastrophic radioactivity release at Davis-Besse could instantly ruin the drinking water supply for many millions of people downstream in the U.S., Canada, and numerous Native American and First Nations."

Intervenor Michael Keegan of Don't Waste Michigan in Monroe said "This radioactive rust bucket has got to go before it blows."

The NRC's 1982 report "Calculation of Reactor Accident Consequences," based on 1970 Census data, determined that a major accident at Davis-Besse could cause 10,000 fatal cancers downwind, 1,400 "peak early fatalities," 73,000 "peak early injuries," and \$84 billion in property damage in the region. Intervenors have challenged the conclusions on casualties as severe underestimates, based on population growth over the past 40 years. Adjusted for inflation, property damages would now top \$184 billion, in Year 2009 Dollars.